



Counting Sefira Somewhat Early

לעילוי נשמת **יואל אפרים בן אברהם עוזיאל זלצמן ז"ל**

Question: My shul davens Mincha right before sunset and Ma'ariv right after it. During the sefira period, may I rely on sefirat ha'omer done at that time?

Answer: We find different starting times for *mitzvot* of the night/next halachic day. The time for evening *Kri'at Shema* is *tzeit hakochavim* (=*tzhk*; the emergence of three stars) (Berachot 2a; Shulchan Aruch, Orach Chayim 235:1). The main *mitzvot* of *Seder* night are also from *tzhk* (Rosh, Pesachim 10:2). In contrast, one may make *Kiddush* on Shabbat from *plag hamincha*, well before sunset (Shulchan Aruch, OC 267:2), and according to many, can also *daven Ma'ariv* then (Berachot 27a; Shulchan Aruch and Rama, OC 233:1).

Regarding *sefirat ha'omer*, the Rashba (Shut I:154) posits that counting while it is still daytime is worthless, because the number day counted is wrong, and one must repeat it at night. He and the Shulchan Aruch (OC 489:2) say that "those who are careful" count after *tzhk*.

However, there are halachic indications for leeway. The Avudraham (see Beit Yosef, OC 489), says that one who *davens* in a *minyan* for *Ma'ariv* before the end of the day, counts with them without a *beracha* and should plan to

repeat the counting at night with a *beracha*. He explains that he should do this with intention that if he forgets to repeat it later, the earlier counting can be of some value. The Beit Yosef is skeptical of this condition's efficacy, but he cites the *halacha* anyway (Shulchan Aruch ibid. 3). The assumption, though, is that we do not want to rely on the early *sefira*.

However, regarding bein hashemashot (=bhsh), between sunset and tzhk, there is significant room for leniency, especially because it is likely that sefirat ha'omer in our times, when no korban ha'omer is brought, is only a Rabbinic obligation (see Tosafot, Menachot 66a; the Rambam, Temidin 7:24 posits it is still from the Torah.) The Magen Avraham (489:6) says one who counted during bhsh fulfills the mitzvah. The Mishna Berura (489:14) explains that since bhsh is a safek of whether it is night or day and since we assume the mitzvah is Rabbinic, leniency is understandable.

However, many *poskim* frown upon counting during *bhsh*. Some warn against dismissing the Rambam's opinion that the *mitzvah* is still from the Torah (see Eliya Rabba 489:10). Others point

Jonathan Rosenblum, DPM 050-595-5161

Pediatric and Geriatric Foot Care, Bunions, Hammertoes, and Diabetic Wound Care Eretz Hemdah, the Institute for Advanced Jewish Studies, Jerusalem, is headed by Rav Yosef Carmel and Rav Moshe Ehrenreich, founded by Rav Shaul Yisraeli, zt"l, to prepare rabbanim and dayanim to serve the National Religious community in the Israel and abroad. Ask the Rabbi is a joint venture of the OU, Eretz Hemdah, and OU Israel's Torah Tidbits.



out that we avoid relying on doubts regarding Rabbinic *mitzvot* when we can do them without doubt; this is especially so when a *beracha* is involved and when one night of invalid *sefira* can disqualify future nights' *sefira* and their *berachot* (see Divrei Yatziv, OC 214).

The exact time of your *shul*'s *sefira* can be impactful. The earliest time that might be *tzhk* is 13.5 minutes after sunset (there are different opinions, by a few minutes, of when sunset is in hilly regions); many posit that *tzeit* is approximately 20 minutes after sunset. On the other hand, according to Rabbeinu Tam's approach (albeit our communities mainly do not factor it in to their decisions), *bhsh* **starts** only around an hour after sunset.

There are often strong communal reasons to have no break or a short one between *Mincha* and *Ma'ariv*, and these can justify an earlier than ideal *sefirat ha'omer*. For the individual, the best practice from a purist perspective is to count on the basis of the "*sefira* leader's" beracha (who should have in mind to be *motzi* anyone who wants/needs it – see Pri Chadash, OC 489:8) and then repeat the *sefira* without



a beracha when it is definitely time. This is different from the Avudraham above who had people do their main sefira at night without a minyan and the earlier counting was "just in case." Here, we assume the main counting is during bhsh with the tzibbur (it is generally better to count with the tzibbur – see Ba'er Heitev, OC 489:20; Minchat Yitzchak IX:56) and the repetition is in case it had been too early. Nowadays, if one uses apps and alarms to remind him to count, there is little room for concern. If one is self-conscious about just answering amen or fears it can be divisive, he may join the community's practice and make the beracha during bhsh.

Having a dispute?



For a Din Torah in English or Hebrew contact:

Eretz Hemdah - Gazit Rabbinical Court

077-215-8-215 • Fax: (02) 537-9626 beitdin@eretzhemdah.org

Dr. Eliezer Rosenblum

NYS Licensed and Board Certified

Chiropractor
Offices in Jerusalem, Ramat Beit Shemesh

052-662-4658

All your jewelry needs in one place!

A 5th generation skilled craftsman will fix, refurbish, polish or restore your family heirlooms, Kiddush cups, candlesticks, and any gold/silver jewelry. Deliveries directly to/from your home in Jerusalem area Details: Santo - 052-228-9627