

COVENANT & CONVERSATION

THOUGHTS ON THE WEEKLY PARSHA

RABBI LORD JONATHAN SACKS ZT"L

FORMER CHIEF RABBI OF THE UNITED HEBREW CONGREGATIONS OF THE COMMONWEALTH

SHABBAT HAGADOL

May the learning of these Divrei Torah be לעילוי נשמת HaRav Ya'akov Zvi ben David Arieh zt''l

לעילוי נשמות

פנחס בן יעקב אשר וגולדה בת ישראל דוד אייז ע"ה ועזריאל בן אריה לייב ומעניה בת יצחק שרטר ע"ה

Is There Such A Thing As Lashon Tov?

The Sages understood *tsara'at*, the theme of this week's parsha, not as an illness but as a miraculous public exposure of the sin of *lashon hara*, speaking badly about people. Judaism is a sustained meditation on the power of words to heal or harm, mend or destroy. Just as God created the world with words, He empowered us to create, and destroy, relationships with words.

The rabbis said much about *lashon hara*, but virtually nothing about the corollary, *lashon tov*, "good speech". The phrase does not appear in either the Babylonian Talmud or the Talmud Yerushalmi. It figures only in two midrashic passages (where it refers to praising God). But *lashon hara* does

Mazal Tov to Ezra Spiewak
on your Bar Mitzvah
Love from your parents,
grandparents and siblings

not mean speaking badly about God. It means speaking badly about human beings. If it is a sin to speak badly about people, is it a mitzvah to speak well about them? My argument will be that it is, and to show this, let us take a journey through the sources.

In Mishnah Avot we read the following:

Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai had five (pre-eminent) disciples, namely Rabbi Eliezer ben Hyrcanus, Rabbi Joshua ben Chananya, Rabbi Yose the Priest, Rabbi Shimon ben Netanel, and Rabbi Elazar ben Arach.

He used to recount their praise: Eliezer ben Hyrcanus: a plastered well that never loses a drop. Joshua ben Chananya: happy the one who gave him birth. Yose the Priest: a pious man. Shimon ben Netanel: a man who fears sin. Elazar ben Arach: an ever-flowing spring. Ethics of the Fathers 2:10-11

However, the practice of Rabban Yochanan in praising his disciples seems to stand in contradiction to a Talmudic principle:

Rav Dimi, brother of Rav Safra said: Let no one ever talk in praise of his neighbour, for praise will lead to criticism. *Arachin 16a*

Rashi gives two explanations of this statement. Having delivered excessive praise [yoter midai], the speaker himself will come to qualify his remarks, admitting for the

sake of balance that the person of whom he speaks also has faults. Alternatively, others will point out his faults in response to the praise. For Rashi, the crucial consideration is, is the praise judicious, accurate, true, or it is overstated? If the former, it is permitted; if the latter, it is forbidden. Evidently Rabban Yochanan was careful not to exaggerate.

Rambam, however, sees matters differently. He writes: "Whoever speaks well about his neighbour in the presence of his enemies is guilty of a secondary form of evil speech [avak lashon hara], since he will provoke them to speak badly about him" (Hilchot Deot 7:4). According to the Rambam the issue is not whether the praise is moderate or excessive, but the context in which it is delivered. If it is done in the presence of friends of the person about whom you are speaking, it is permitted. It is forbidden only when you are among his enemies and detractors. Praise then becomes a provocation, with bad consequences.

Are these merely two opinions, or is there something deeper at stake? There is a famous passage in the Talmud which discusses how one should sing the praises of a bride at her wedding:

Our Rabbis taught: How should you dance before the bride [i.e. what should one sing]? The disciples of Hillel hold that at a wedding you should sing that the bride is beautiful, whether she is or not. Shammai's disciples disagree. Whatever the occasion, don't tell a lie. "Do you call that a lie?" the Hillel's disciples respond. "In the eyes of the groom at least, the bride is beautiful."

What's really at stake here is not just temperament – puritanical Shammaites versus good-natured Hillelites – but two views about the nature of language. The Shammaites



Jerusalem Real Estate is My Business Eta: 054-723-3863

Amazing stand alone homes in OLD KATAMON, TALBIYA, BAKA, GERMAN COLONY

GERMAN COLONY/TALBIYA

400 sqm on one floor parking storage large sukka terrace



In OLD KATAMON 220 sqm plus 80 sqm of outdoor space. For renovation, pkg & storage. Includes separate unit. 8,999,000 NIS

In GERMAN COLONY. 300 sqm plus 170 sqm registered garden. Plus parking and roof top terrace.



Price: 18,000,000 NIS

ARNONA exclusive:
Fantastic cottage for sale, registered at 182 sqm plus ground floor unit (can be granny flat). Parking. Built on 3 levels with large terrace on 2nd floor. 5 bedrooms!!!
Perfect for a young family.
Price 6,900,000 NIS



In BAKA, 236 sqm on two floors, plus 80 sqm of outdoor space, high ceilings, authentic Jerusalem bldg with modern addition. 4 bedrooms, office/ or sitting room. Master suite on entrance level. Parking & storage. Price: 15,950,0000



BAKA Two story penthouse 200 sqm. Light open space kitchen & living room, sukkah terrace. Elevator, balconies, 2 parking, elevator, storage room. 12,500,000 NIS



Eta Morris Realty, Ltd. etamorrisrealestate@gmail.com Eta: 054-723-3863 etamorrisrealty.co.il think of language as a way of making statements, which are either true or false. The Hillelites understand that language is about more than making statements. We can use language to encourage, empathise, motivate, and inspire. Or we can use it to discourage, disparage, criticise, and depress. Language does more than convey information. It conveys emotion. It creates or disrupts a mood. The sensitive use of speech involves social and emotional intelligence. Language, in J. L. Austin's famous account can be performative as well as informative.

The discourse between the diciples of Hillel and Shammai is similar to the argument between Rambam and Rashi. For Rashi, as for Shammai, the key question about praise is: is it true, or is it excessive? For Rambam as for Hillel, the question is: what is the context? Is it being said among enemies or friends?



Will it create warmth and esteem or envy and resentment?

We can go one further, for the disagreement between Rashi and Rambam about praise may be related to a more fundamental disagreement about the nature of the command, "You shall love your neighbour as yourself" (Lev. 19:18). Rashi interprets the command to mean: do not do to your neighbour what you would not wish him to do to you (Rashi to Sanhedrin 84b). Rambam, however, says that the command includes the duty "to speak in his praise" (Hilchot Deot 6:3). Rashi evidently sees praise of one's neighbour as optional, while Rambam sees it as falling within the command of love.

We can now answer a question we should have asked at the outset about the Mishnah in Avot that speaks of Yochanan ben Zakkai's disciples. Avot is about ethics, not about history or biography. Why then does it tell us that Rabban Yochanan had disciples? That, surely, is a fact not a value, a piece of information not a guide to how to live.

However, we can now see that the Mishnah is telling us something profound indeed. The very first statement in Avot includes the principle: "Raise up many disciples." But how do you create disciples? How do you inspire people to become what they could become, to reach the full measure of their potential? Answer: By acting as did Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai when he praised his students, showing them their specific strengths.

He did not flatter them. He guided them to see their distinctive talents. Eliezer ben Hyrcanus, the "well that never loses a drop", was not creative but he had a remarkable memory – not unimportant in the days before the Oral Torah was written in books. Elazar ben Arach, the "ever-flowing spring," was creative, but needed to be fed by mountain waters (years later he separated from his colleagues and it is said that he forgot all he had learned).

Rabban Yochanan ben Zakai took a Hillel-Rambam view of praise. He used it not so much to describe as to motivate. And that is *lashon tov*. Evil speech diminishes us, good speech helps us grow. Evil speech puts people down, good speech lifts them up. Focused, targeted praise, informed by considered judgment of individual strengths, and sustained by faith in people and their potentiality, is what makes teachers great and their disciples greater than they would otherwise have been. That is what we learn from Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai.

So there is such a thing as *lashon tov*. According to Rambam it falls within the command of "Love your neighbour as yourself." According to Avot it is one way of "raising up many disciples." It is as creative as *lashon hara* is destructive.

Seeing the good in people and telling them so is a way of helping it become real, becoming a midwife to their personal growth. If so, then not only must we praise God. We must praise people too.

These weekly teachings from **Rabbi Sacks zt"I** are part of his 'Covenant & Conversation' series on the weekly Torah teaching. With thanks to the Schimmel Family for their generous sponsorship, dedicated in loving memory of Harry (Chaim) Schimmel. Visit www.RabbiSacks.org for more.



Having a Brit? KISEI SHEL ELIYAHU

Available to borrow from the OU Israel Center donated by Marion & Michael Silman Ita Rochel 02-560-9125



FOR SALE IN JERUSALEM:

IN QUIET & PASTORAL GERMAN COLONY

3-room apartment with private, beautiful & large courtyard, small original & intimate house, easily dividable into 2 apartments: 2-room + studio apartment (ideal for clinic), both with private entrance & own courtyard, full privacy & quiet. Near synagogues, parks, Jerusalem's Nature Museum, Emek Refaim shops, cafes & more. Exclusive! Moshe 053-6305725

BAKA (MORDECHAI HA YEHUDI ST.)

Beautiful 5.5-room garden apartment in the heart of Baka, an Arab-style house. Next to Derech Beit Lechem shops & restaurants. Private entrance, 152 sq meters, stunning large garden, lots of light. Exclusive! Nava 053-6642512

YEMIN MOSHE

Unique picturesque home with views to the Old City 174 sqm, 5.5 rooms, arched ceilings & windows. Separate entrance unit, close to parking, walking distance to the Old City, Mamila, major hotels. Exclusive! Nava 053-6642512

3 Moshe Hess St., Jerusalem **0778038511**

Dr. Harry Weisman

Former Assist. Clinical Professor of Medicine, UCLA School of Medicine; Div. of Endocrinology & Metabolism

Author of The 18% Solution – Lose 18% of Your weight in 18 Weeks



Weight loss Consultation

+972 53 472 2159