



Forgetting *R'tzei* at *Seuda Shlishit*

לעילוי נשמת
יואל אפרים בן אברהם עוזיאל זלצמן ז"ל

Question: I was not sure if during *Birkat Hamazon* (=BHMZ) after *seuda shlishit*, I said *R'tzei V'hachalitzenu* or not. Should I have repeated BHMZ?

Answer: The rule is that one who forgets *R'tzei* in BHMZ on Shabbat must repeat BHMZ (Berachot 49b). Is that also true for one who is unsure (*safek*) if he recited it? On one hand, the requirement to mention Shabbat in *Birkat Hamazon* is only Rabbinic, making it logical to apply *safek berachot l'hakel* when there is a *safek* whether one said *R'tzei*. Indeed, regarding one who is unsure whether he recited *Ya'aleh V'Yavo* (=YVY) on Rosh Chodesh, the Rama (Orach Chayim 422:1) invokes *safek berachot l'hakel*. However, the Mishna Berura (288:16) points out that the consensus of *Acharonim* rejects his opinion because we can **presume** he left out YVY, as there is a *chazaka* that one who was not concentrating (a fair assumption about one who soon thereafter (see below) does not remember what he said) did not recite infrequent additions. This follows the precedent of a *safek* on what one said regarding rain-related recitations at the beginning of a "recitation season" (see Shulchan Aruch, OC 114:8).

Even if one does not accept the Rama, there are a few reasons to not repeat

BHMZ in a case of *safek* if he said *R'tzei* (see Yabia Omer VII, OC 28): 1. A weekly addition is not as easily forgotten as a monthly one. 2. The different atmosphere of Shabbat makes it easier to remember *R'tzei* than YVY. 3. An extra *tefilla* done due to *safek* is not problematic (Berachot 21a), whereas for BHMZ, it is problematic. Indeed Rav Ovadia Yosef (Yabia Omer *ibid.*) rules not to repeat BHMZ in a *safek* if he recited *R'tzei*. On the other hand, Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata (57:7) accepts the Mishna Berura that we should repeat BHMZ for a *safek* of missing *R'tzei* (if the doubt arises soon after he should have said it – see Mishna Berura 422:10).

However, there is an accepted reason not to repeat BHMZ in your case. The *gemara* (Berachot 49b) says that one who forgets YVY in BHMZ of Rosh Chodesh, as opposed to Shabbat and *Yom Tov*, does not repeat BHMZ. The difference is that on Shabbat, one must eat [enough bread to make BHMZ a necessity – Tosafot ad loc.], whereas on Rosh Chodesh, he need not. The Mishna Berura (188:26) explains that Chazal instituted that only for the special days when BHMZ is necessary are the additions to BHMZ for those days essential. Although some consider it a full obligation to have bread at *seuda shlishit*, other serious positions do not view it as a

The Orthodox Union - via its website - fields questions of all types in areas of kashrut, Jewish law and values. Some of them are answered by Eretz Hemdah, the Institute for Advanced Jewish Studies, Jerusalem, headed by Rav Yosef Carmel and Rav Moshe Ehrenreich, founded by HaRav Shaul Yisraeli zt"l, to prepare rabbanim and dayanim to serve the National Religious community in Israel and abroad. Ask the Rabbi is a joint venture of the OU, Yerushalayim Network, Eretz Hemdah... and OU Israel's Torah Tidbits.



full requirement (see Shulchan Aruch, OC 291:5). Therefore, repeating *BHMZ* due to a forgotten *R'tzei* at *seuda shlishit* might be unwarranted, and one must not take that chance (Shulchan Aruch, OC 188:8; Mishna Berura *ibid.* 31; Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata *ibid.*). According to most, this is true even for one who is always careful to eat bread at *seuda shlishit* because the fact that he always *bentches* is a personal decision, not an objective Shabbat obligation (see Shemirat Shabbat K'hilchata 57:(20)).

It is possible to do a type of repetition. The *gemara* (*ibid.* a) says that for one who realized he left out the addition after finishing the third *beracha* but before starting the fourth, there is an independent *beracha* for each of the respective days to thank Hashem for giving us the day. The *gemara* mentions this even regarding Rosh Chodesh, but leaves it as an unsolved question whether the *beracha* on Rosh Chodesh finishes with the *Baruch ata Hashem ...* form. This *beracha* applies also to *seuda shlishit*, and since *seuda shlishit* is likely supposed to be a real meal, the Mishna Berura (Be'ur Halacha to 188:8) advocates finishing it with a *beracha* form. However, one would not do so if he *bentches* after nightfall, as it is a doubt whether the additions are called for then, and a separate *beracha* is therefore not warranted (Be'ur Halacha to 188:10). Regarding a case that he missed this cut-off point, some allow reciting *R'tzei* during the section of "*Harachaman*"

recitations, but the stronger opinion is to not do so (see Rama, OC 188:7). ■

Having a dispute?



For a Din Torah in English or Hebrew contact 'Eretz Hemdah - Gazit' Rabbinical Court:
077-215-8-215 • fax: (02) 537-9626
beitdin@eretzhemdah.org

Over 1600 audio and video shiurim
for listening and downloading
plus written articles
www.rabbisholomgold.com

NETANEL ROSIN'S FARM TO FAMILY

Want to shop from the
convenience of your home?

ORDER ONLINE AND GET THE
PRODUCTS YOU PREFER DELIVERED
STRAIGHT TO YOUR DOOR!

American
Service!

ORDER TODAY
AND ENJOY SUPERIOR QUALITY,
SELECTION AND SERVICE!



✓ American
Products &
Specialty Items!

✓ Top quality,
organic
& regular
Mehadrin
produce

www.FarmToFamily.co.il
Netanel 050-344-6261 | Office 058-444-6260

Use coupon code welcome2ftf and save 5% off your first order!